60 DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

Sent in Compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

DATE:

August 9, 2019

TO:

Stephen Williamson, Chief Executive Officer

FORAGER PROJECT, LLC

Robert Twyman, Chief Executive Officer

WHOLE FOODS MARKET CALIFORNIA, INC.

Patrick Bradley, Chief Executive Officer

MRS. GOOCH'S NATURAL FOOD MARKETS, INC.

California Attorney's General Office

District Attorney's General Office for 58 Counties

City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los

Angeles

FROM:

André E. Jardini

I. INTRODUCTION

Knapp, Petersen & Clarke represents:

- Madeleine Wachs; San Francisco, CA
- Gabriela Garcia; San Francisco, CA
- Stacia Cullors; Los Angeles, CA

The above-named individuals are acting in the interest of the general public to promote more awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. This Notice is provided to the public agencies listed above and in the attached service list hereto pursuant to California Health and Safety Code § 25249.6, et seq. (Proposition 65). Also, this Notice is being provided to the alleged violators, Forager Project, LLC, Whole Foods Market California, Inc., and Mrs. Gooch's Natural Food Markets, Inc. The violations covered by this Notice consist of the product exposure, routes of exposure, and types of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the toxic chemicals ("listed chemicals") identified below, as follows:

Product Exposure:

See Section VI.

Listed Chemical: Routes of Exposure: Lead.

Toutes of Exposu

Ingestion.

Types of Harm: Birth defects and other reproductive harm.

60 DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

Sent in Compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) Page 2

Product Exposure:

See Section VI.

Listed Chemical:

Cadmium.

Routes of Exposure:

Ingestion.

Types of Harm:

Developmental toxicity and male reproductive toxicity.

II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE)

The specific types of products that are causing consumer exposure in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are listed as the products in Section VI below. All products within the categories covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the "products." Exposures to the listed chemicals from the use of the products have been occurring without the clear and reasonable warning required by Proposition 65, dating back as far as February 20, 2015. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemicals resulting from ingestion of the products, California persons lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemicals from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products.

California consumers, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the products, are exposed to the listed chemicals. California consumers are exposed to the listed chemicals by ingesting the product, in the way intended by the alleged violators. People likely to be exposed to the listed chemicals include children and adults, including pregnant women.

III. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions concerning this Notice to counsel at the following address:

André E. Jardini K.L. Myles Michael D. Carr KNAPP, PETERSEN & CLARKE 550 North Brand Boulevard, Suite 1500 Glendale, CA 91203 Telephone: (818) 547-5000

PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violators reference, I have attached a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary") which has been prepared by the OEHHA.

IV.

60 DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

Sent in Compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) Page 3

V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, the above persons, through their counsel, intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged violators unless such violators enter into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such products; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the lead and cadmium exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b). If the alleged violators are interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact counsel identified in Section III above. It should be noted that neither the persons named herein nor their counsel can (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60 day Notice has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any district or city attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement will resolve the claims of the persons named above, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

VI. ADDITIONAL NOTICE INFORMATION

Identified below is the specific product purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California that is an offending product covered by this Notice.

I believe and allege that the sale of the offending product also has occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 "clear and reasonable warning" at one or more locations and/or via other means including, but not limited to, transactions made over-the-counter, business-to-business, through the internet and/or via a catalogue by the violators and other retailers and distributors of the manufacturer.

Product	Manufacturer(s) Distributor	Toxins
Forager Greens & Greens	Forager Project, LLC	Lead, Cadmium

APPENDIX A

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.¹ These implementing regulations are available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html.

WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Proposition 65 List." Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

¹ All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at; http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65 list/Newlist.html.

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65.

Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

Prohibition from discharges into drinking water. A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

Grace Period. Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Businesses with nine or fewer employees. Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employe a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at:

http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food. Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant² it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

² See Section 25501(a)(4)

HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, ANDRÉ E. JARDINI, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60 day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
 - 2. I am the attorney for the noticing parties;
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action;
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understanding that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute; and
- 5. A copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the attorney general attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate including information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: August 9, 2019 KNAPP, PETERSEN & CLARKE

André E Jardini

PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is 550 North Brand Boulevard, Suite 1500, Glendale, CA 91203.

On August 9, 2019, I served the following documents:

- 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);
- PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND
- CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS (SERVED ONLY ON THE ATTORNEY GENERAL)

on the entity listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entity listed below and providing each envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative -

Stephen Williamson Chief Executive Officer Forager Project, LLC 235 Montgomery Street San Francisco, CA 94104

Robert Twyman, Chief Executive Officer WHOLE FOODS MARKET CALIFORNIA, INC. 5980 Horton Street, Suite 200 Emeryville, CA 94608

Patrick Bradley, Chief Executive Officer MRS. GOOCH'S NATURAL FOOD MARKETS, INC. 207 Goode Avenue, 7th Floor Glendale, CA 91203

as well as by providing copies of the above documents electronically uploaded to the public enforcers according to directions from their respective offices, and/or by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to each party listed below, and served as follows: By placing each envelope in a United States Postal Service mailbox, postage prepaid:

- The District Attorney for Each of the 58 counties in California;
- The City Attorney for Los Angeles, San Diego, San Jose, San Francisco and Sacramento; and

- The Attorney General of the State of California

A list of addresses for each of these recipients is attached.

Executed on August 9, 2019 at Glendale, California.

Mindy Merahen Mindy Menahen

SERVICE LIST

	-		
The Hon. Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon St., Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	The Hon. S. Melyssah Rios Lassen County District Attorney 2950 Riverside Dr., Suite 102 Susanville, CA 96130	The Hon. Candice Hooper- Mancino San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th St. Hollister, CA 95023	The Hon. Matthew Rogers Tehama County District Attorney P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Hon. Michael Atwell Alpine County District Attorney 17300 Hwy 89 P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	The Hon. Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple St. Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	The Hon. Jason Anderson San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd St., San Bernardino, CA 92415- 0502	The Hon. Donna Daly Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
The Hon. Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court St., #202 Jackson, CA 95642	The Hon. Sally O. Moreno Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Ave. Madera, CA 93637	The Hon. Summer Stephan San Diego County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway St., Ste. 1300 San Diego, CA 92101	The Hon. Tim Ward Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Mooney Blvd., Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291-4593
The Hon. Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Admin Bldg. Oroville, CA 95965	The Hon. Lori Frugoli Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 130 San Rafael, CA 94903	The Hon. George Gascon San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant St., Third Floor San Francisco, CA 94103	The Hon. Laura Krieg Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 N. Washington St. Sonora, CA 95370
The Hon. Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249	The Hon. Walter Wall Mariposa County District Attorney P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	The Hon. Tori Verber Salazar San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 E. Weber Ave. Room 202 P.O. Box 990 Stockton, CA 95202	The Hon. Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney 800 S. Victoria Ave. Ventura, CA 93009
The Hon. Matthew R. Beauchamp Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth St., Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	The Hon. C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney 100 North State St. P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 9548	The Hon. Dan Dow San Luis Obispo County District Attorney Courthouse Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	The Hon, Jeff Reisig Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second St. Woodland, CA 95695

The Hon. Diana Becton Contra Costa County District Attorney 900 Ward St. Martinez, CA 94553	The Hon. Kimberly Lewis Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main St. Merced, CA 95340	The Hon. Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	The Hon. Clint Curry Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth St., Ste. 152 Marysville, CA 95901
The Hon. Katherine Micks Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H St., Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	The Hon. Samuel D. Kyllo Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court St., Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101	The Hon. Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101	The Hon. Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles James K. Hahn City Hall East 200 North Main St., 8th' Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012
The Hon. Vern Pierson El Dorado County District Attorney 778 Pacific St. Placerville, CA 95667	The Hon. Tim Kendall Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 2053 Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546	The Hon. Jeffrey Rosen Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 West Hedding St., West Wing San Jose, CA 95110	The Hon. Matthew Ruyak Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I St., 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814
The Hon. Lisa Smittcamp Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare St. Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721	The Hon. Jeannine M. Pacioni Monterey County District Attorney P.O. Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902	The Hon. Jeff Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060	The Hon. Mara Elliott Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101
The Hon. Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	The Hon. Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney P.O. Box 720 Napa, CA 94559	The Hon. Stephanie Bridgett Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West St. Redding, CA 96001	The Hon. Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102
The Hon. Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501	The Hon. Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial St. Nevada City, CA 95959	The Hon. Sandra Groven Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936	The Hon. Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara St., 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113

	1		
The Hon. Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main St., Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	The Hon. Todd Spitzer Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Dr. West Santa Ana, CA 92701	The Hon. James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097	Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay St. Suite 2000 P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612- 0550
The Hon. Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney 168 North Edwards St. Independence, CA 93526	The Hon. R. Scott Owens Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Roseville, CA 95678	The Hon. Krishna Abrams Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas St., Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533	
The Hon. Cynthia Zimmer Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301	The Hon. David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main St., Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971	The Hon. Jill Ravitch Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Drive Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403	
The Hon. Keith Fagundes Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230	The Hon. Michael Hestrin Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange St. Riverside, CA 92501	The Hon. Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th St., Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354	
The Hon. Susan Krones Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes St. Lakeport, CA 95453	The Hon. Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G St. Sacramento, CA 95814	The Hon. Amanda Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991	